



THE NATIONAL BOARD FOR
SAFEGUARDING CHILDREN
IN THE CATHOLIC CHURCH

**Review of Child Safeguarding Practice
in the religious congregation of**

The Daughters of the Cross of Liege

undertaken by

**The National Board for Safeguarding Children in the
Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI)**

Date: November 2015

CONTENTS	Page
<i>Background</i>	3
<i>Introduction</i>	4
<i>Role Profile</i>	4
<i>Profile of Members</i>	5
<i>Policy and Procedures Document</i>	5
<i>Structures</i>	6
<i>Management of Allegations</i>	6
<i>Conclusion</i>	6
<i>Terms of Reference</i>	8

Background

The National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI) was asked by the Sponsoring Bodies, namely the Irish Episcopal Conference, the Conference of Religious of Ireland and the Irish Missionary Union, to undertake a comprehensive review of safeguarding practice within and across all the Church authorities on the island of Ireland.

The NBSCCCI is aware that some religious congregations have ministries that involve direct contact with children while others do not. In religious congregations that have direct involvement with children, reviews of child safeguarding have been undertaken by measuring their practice compliance against all seven Church standards. Where a religious congregation no longer has, or never had ministry involving children and has not received any allegation of sexual abuse, the NBSCCCI reviews are conducted using a shorter procedure. The size, age and activity profiles of religious congregations can vary significantly and the NBSCCCI accepts that it is rational that the form of review be tailored to the profile of each Church authority, where the ministry with children is limited or non-existent. The procedure for assessment of safeguarding practice with such congregations is set out in the contents page of this report. The NBSCCCI welcomes that in order to have full openness, transparency and accountability, religious congregations that do not have ministry with children have made requests to have their safeguarding practice examined and commented upon.

The purpose of this review remains the same and it is to confirm that current safeguarding practice complies with the standards set down within the guidance issued by the Sponsoring Bodies in February 2009 *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance Document for the Catholic Church in Ireland* and that all known allegations and concerns had been appropriately dealt with. To achieve this task, safeguarding practice in each of these Church Authorities is reviewed through an examination of policy and procedures, and through interviews with key personnel involved both within and external to the Religious Congregation.

This report contains the findings of the *Review of Child Safeguarding Practice in the religious congregation of the Daughters of the Cross of Liege* undertaken by the NBSCCCI in line with the request made to it by the Sponsoring Bodies.

The findings of the review have been shared with a reference group before being submitted to the Provincial leader along with any recommendations arising from the findings. The review is not based on a review of case material as during the relevant time period there were no allegations made against members of the congregation that were within the Terms of Reference. There also were no allegations in respect of other forms of abuse within the time period, in respect of deceased and living members of the congregation. The review therefore is primarily based on policies and procedures made available plus interviews with key personnel involved in the safeguarding process within the congregation, particularly in the services run by the congregation.

1. Introduction

The foundress of the Congregation of the Daughters of the Cross of Liege, Jeanne Haze was born in Leige, Belgium in February 1782. As a result of their experience of suffering during the French Revolution, Jeanne and her sister, Ferdinande decided to dedicate themselves to those in need and opened a school for poor children in their locality. They were soon joined by other young women wishing to lead a religious life and in 1833 Jeanne and Ferdinande made their perpetual vows, receiving the names Mother Marie Therese and Mother Aloysia. Thus the congregation of the Daughters of the Cross was born in the Carmelite Church of Potay, next to their own small Convent. The Bishop agreed to the founding of this Religious Community and entrusted Father Jean Guillaume Habets to draw up a Rule for them and this came into being on the 8th September 1833.

The Congregation responded to the needs of the people around them, nursing the sick in their own homes, caring for women prisoners, and teaching children by day and adults in the evening. Before long, communities were founded in Germany (1849), India (1861), England (1863), and Ireland (1921). Mother Marie Therese was beatified by the Catholic Church in 1991.

“The sisters draw their inspiration, their strength and their courage from the life of prayer and contemplation of the Cross. They hope to share with all who work with them and for them the compassion of Christ and the peace that comes from joy-filled service”.
Constitutions 93.

2. Role Profile (past and present role with children):

Historically the Congregation of the Daughters of the Cross of Liege has had roles in education and nursing in Ireland. The Sisters were responsible for two schools, St. Joseph’s in Donaghmore, Northern Ireland, and Mary Immaculate School in Stillorgan, County Dublin.

St. Joseph’s was a school for all ages and catered for boarders. It opened in 1923 and was passed to the care and control of the Archdiocese of Armagh in 1998, although the Congregation had a presence on the Board of Management for a number of years following this, and maintained a convent on the school site until 2007. Throughout this time the Sisters adhered to the Child Safeguarding Policy of the school and archdiocese.

The Mary Immaculate School in Stillorgan was established in 1957 at the request of the Archbishop of Dublin. It was developed to cater for the educational needs of profoundly hearing impaired boys and was a preparatory school for St. Joseph’s School for the Deaf in Cabra, Dublin. The emphasis in the school was on speech, lip reading and the acquisition of language. As was the policy at the time, the Sisters were given very specific training at Manchester University around implementing the “Oral/ Aural” method.

The Congregation managed a small general hospital, St. Gabriel’s, in Cabinteely, County Dublin between 1949 and 1997 when it closed. Predominantly, the Sisters ministered as nurses for children with heart conditions.

The Congregation briefly established a community in Limerick and between 1979 and 1983 when a Sister was employed by the education department as the Principal in a local school.

Review of child safeguarding practice – The Daughters of the Cross of Liege

Another Sister was involved in parish ministry and two further Sisters were engaged in community work in the locality.

Between 1984 and 1986 a member of the Congregation was employed by a voluntary organization in a nursery in the Ballybrack area of Dublin.

There is no current ministry with children in Ireland. Two Sisters work as hospital Chaplains in adult hospitals in Dublin.

In England the Congregation is still involved in the provision of services for children and vulnerable adults. These services are fully regulated and inspected by the Care Quality Commission and OFSTED. All Sisters in England are registered with the Disclosure and Barring Service (DBS), as is required for all religious in England. There are currently twenty Sisters who live in England that previously served in Ireland. They are subject to the requirements of the DBS.

3. Profile of Members:

There are twelve members of the Congregation of the Daughters of the Cross of Liege residing in Ireland. Two of these members, have health care needs and are cared for in residential establishments and the remaining ten live in the convent in Stillorgan, County Dublin. The Sisters have an age range of between 66 and one 101 years.

4. Policy and Procedures Document:

The Daughters of the Cross of Liege have a detailed 60 page Child Safeguarding Policy which appropriately follows the seven standards of the NBSCCCI. The policy is dated the 30th October 2013 and includes a review date of October 2016. It outlines that the policy is binding on all personnel who work for the Congregation in Ireland: Sisters, staff and volunteers.

The Congregation also has a one page document which is displayed in the convent and staff room in Stillorgan. It states; *We recognize the right and dignity of children and vulnerable adults, and are committed to their protection and support.* The document clearly outlines the name and contact number of the Designated Liaison Person, civil authorities and NBSCCCI.

In October 2013 all members of the congregation in Ireland participated in three sessions of child safeguarding awareness training facilitated by a NBSCCCI trainer. The two Sisters who are still active as Chaplains within adult hospitals, and have participated in recent child safeguarding training as part of the requirements of their role.

The Congregation is part of the St. Stephen's Green Trust (SSGTI) which is a grant giving philanthropic organisation working to improve the lives of those affected by poverty and social exclusion. In 2010 this trust commissioned a study to focus on the lives and unmet needs of those who experienced abuse in religious organisations and inform the most appropriate allocation of funds to assist them. The SSGTI also administers a survivor's grant programme.

5. Structures:

The English Province of the Daughters of the Cross of Liege includes communities in England, Ireland and California. There are a total of 58 Sisters in the English Province, twelve of whom reside in Ireland. The Congregation has a further seven Provinces and three Regions (a Region is not yet established independently as a Province) across Europe, Asia and Africa. Each Province has a Provincial Superior and each Region has a Leader. They are also supported by a Council, the number of which depends on the size of the Province/ Region, for example, the English Province has four Councilors. The Provincials/ Regionals and their councils are appointed for three year periods by the Superior General in Council, after consulting with the Sisters in the said province. Provincial and Regional Councils usually meet monthly or as required. Safeguarding is a standing item on the agenda of Provincial and Regional Councils.

The Congregation has a Superior General who is assisted by a Council of Three Sisters. These are elected at the General Chapter that takes place every six years.

The Provincial Superior in the English Province has appointed a Designated Liaison Person to assist with all matters in relation to child safeguarding.

6. Management of Allegations and liaison with the statutory authorities:

The Congregation of the Daughters of the Cross of Liege and the Mary Immaculate School in Stillorgan are discussed in Chapter 16 of the report of the Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse (Ryan Report) 2009, the details relating to the Ryan Commission Investigations fall outside the remit of this Review.

The Congregation has two documented allegations. The first is a letter received in 2009 outlining concerns about the management of the Mary Immaculate School. There is evidence of extensive attempts to meet with the author of the letter to ground the concerns further. There was no response, the congregation appropriately notified the civil authorities, and the case remains open.

The congregation is named as one of two congregations, in a case initially considered to be part of the Redress scheme, which then formed part of a High Court Action against the Congregation and the State. The information relating to these concerns was shared the reviewer who noted that there was no specific allegation made against any member of the Congregation of the Daughters of the Cross of Liege and no Sister was named in these concerns that seemed to relate to practice and policy issues. There has been no contact with the civil authorities in relation to these concerns as they do not relate to an individual against whom there was an allegation.

7. Conclusion:

The Congregation of the Daughter of the Cross of Liege has been involved in the education and nursing care of children in Ireland. There are currently twelve Sisters residing in Ireland and they have no ministry with children.

The Congregation has a detailed Child Safeguarding Policy which is binding on all personnel who work for the Sisters in Ireland. This policy is more than adequate when considering the

Review of child safeguarding practice – The Daughters of the Cross of Liege

current profile of the Congregation in Ireland. The Mary Immaculate School for hearing impaired children was part of the Ryan report 2009 and as such is outside the parameters of this review. There are two documented allegations against the Daughters of the Cross of Liege. Both relate to the management and practice within the Mary Immaculate School and do not provide specific allegations against any member of the Congregation of The Daughters of the Cross of Liege. The reviewer is satisfied that the Congregation has taken significant steps to try further ground these concerns.

In conclusion, the reviewer has no concerns about the current practice in relation to child safeguarding within the congregation of the Daughters of the Cross of Liege.

Review of Child Safeguarding in the Catholic Church in Ireland

Terms of Reference

Small Religious Congregations

(which should be read in conjunction with the accompanying Notes)

Introduction

In order for the NBSCCCI to be able to state that all Church Authorities on the island of Ireland have been evaluated in respect of their child safeguarding policies and practices, both historical and current, then some form of appropriate assessment has to be conducted of every one of these. It is rational however that the form of assessment is tailored to the profile of each Church Authority, and that needless expenditure of resources and unnecessary interference in the life of religious orders and communities that have no children-specific ministry would be avoided.

This review seeks to examine the current arrangements for safeguarding children across small religious congregations /orders, and missionary societies in Ireland who have limited or no direct contact with children as part of the congregation's ministry.

It would also scrutinize practice within all known cases to ensure that they have been responded to appropriately.

The review's methodology is an adaptation of the methodology developed for all dioceses and large religious congregations and missionary societies, where the ministry involves regular contact with children.

The proposed review would consider the following:-

- (a) Former role with children
- (b) Allegations of child abuse against members and how these have been responded to
- (c) Existing relationships with statutory authorities such as the HSE, Gardai in the Republic and the HSCT or PSNI in Northern Ireland.
- (d) Policies in place and being applied for safeguarding children
- (e) Roles and responsibilities and where they exist the operation of Advisory Panels, and Safeguarding Committees

The objective of the review would be to confirm if there have been any allegations and how known allegations have been responded to; in addition the review seeks to confirm what the current arrangements for safeguarding children are. In particular, emphasis will be placed on establishing how policies and practice match up to the standards set down in *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance Document for the Catholic Church in Ireland* published by the National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church in Ireland and launched in February 2009. Priority, at all times, will be given to how policy and practice can be improved and strengthened. If policies and/or practices are identified that are concerning, inadequate, or dangerous, they will be addressed through the provision of guidance and support, and through the reporting of these situations to the appropriate statutory authorities, if this has not already happened. Similarly, those that are good examples

Review of child safeguarding practice – The Daughters of the Cross of Liege

will be highlighted with a view to them being adopted comprehensively across all parts of the Church. All cases that relate to alleged or known offenders that are alive will be read and included in the review. In cases where the alleged or known offender is deceased, these will be sampled in an attempt to gather learning from them that will be used to inform the framing of recommendations.

Guidance Documents

The review will be guided by the following:-

- (a) *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance Document for the Catholic Church in Ireland*
- (b) *Children First* Guidance in ROI; and Regional Child Protection Guidelines in Northern Ireland;
- (c) Legislation that exists in each jurisdiction which contributes to safeguarding children and young people.

The review will be undertaken by the National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI) through their National Office and led by the Chief Executive Officer.

The review process will be overseen by a Reference Group to whom the CEO will report on a regular basis. The membership of this Reference Group has been drawn from each of the statutory child protection agencies in both jurisdictions, along with eminent individuals in the field from academia. The current Reference Group consists of: Dr Helen Buckley (TCD); Mr Paul Harrison (Tusla), and John Toner (SBNI).

It is important to confirm that the value of the review is dependent upon full and complete access to all relevant documentation and information relating to the abuse of children known to the individual Church authorities. The review will proceed on the basis that willingness exists on the part of each of the subjects of the review to provide full access to the fieldwork team, subject, where relevant, to the terms of the Data Processing Deed agreed between the Sponsoring Bodies and entered into between the parties hereto.

Step Guide to the Review Process

Step 1.

A letter of invitation to review is sent by the Provincial/Regional Superior or other person responsible for the congregation/ order or missionary society (hereinafter referred to as ‘the Ordinary’).

Step 2.

The CEO will forward a survey to the provincial which will identify:

- Current number of members
- Past role with children
- Current role with children
- Total number of allegations received up to 2014
- Number of living members against whom there are allegations

Step 3.

For any Order where there have been allegations a full review will proceed, as per step 4 - 23. For those Orders where there have been no known allegations a desk top examination of policies and procedures will take place followed by a site visit to interview all relevant personnel within the safeguarding structure. For these orders step 5 and 13-23 will apply.

Step 4.

The CEO and Ordinary will confirm the dates for the fieldwork for the review, and names of the fieldwork team.

Step 5.

The Church Authority will be asked to make available all of the case files and related documentation in respect of any safeguarding concerns that have been identified within the diocese. The Church Authority will make available a room with wireless internet access for the reviewers to conduct their review of files, so that any records made by the reviewers can be directly typed and stored onto a secure server which is only accessed by the reviewers. In the absence of internet access the reviewers will type their notes onto a secure encrypted USB stick for later uploading onto the secure server.

Step 6.

The Church Authority will be requested to sign the revised Data Processing Deed prior to the arrival of the team.

Step 7.

The Church Authority will arrange a schedule of interviews with all who hold safeguarding roles within its functional area. The designated person and the Church Authority will be available to the reviewers throughout the period of fieldwork.

Step 8.

The fieldwork team when they arrive on site will firstly confirm that they have a suitable place to work in and that all the required documentation has been provided to them for their review. In the event that the fieldwork team forms the opinion that the Church Authority has not provided access to all such documents, the NBSCCCI shall give notice in writing to the Church Authority of the opinion of the fieldwork team and such notice shall specify the reasons for same. Thereupon, the Church Authority shall respond in detail to the notice. Each party shall use its best endeavours to resolve any differences of opinion which shall arise and, in the event that resolution is not arrived at, the parties will attempt to resolve the dispute by recourse to the services of a mediator agreed between them or nominated for the purpose at the request of any of them without prejudice to the NBSCCCI's entitlement to terminate the review. In the event that resolution has not been arrived at following mediation, either party shall be at liberty to terminate forthwith the review.

Step 9.

On arrival, the fieldwork team should be supplied with a single case file index that lists all the cases that have been created within the diocese. These may be divided into two groups. The first group will contain all allegations that relate to living alleged or known perpetrators. The second will contain any that are deceased.

Step 10.

Depending on the volume involved a decision should be made as to whether all or a random sample of the "deceased group" should be reviewed. Care should be taken to include all prominent cases in the sample.

Step 11.

Each case file will be reviewed by each fieldworker independently in the first instance. They will create a written summary with chronological information of the case. In certain cases a second reader may be required, this will be discussed and agreed between the fieldworkers.

Step 12.

Following the reading of the case and the creation of a summary, the fieldworkers will analyse and assess the actions taken in the case. They will assess compliance with agreed Church policy that was extant at that time. They will also indicate whether any current risk exists in respect of the information contained within the file and advise the church Authority of necessary safeguarding action to reduce the risk.

Step 13.

When all the case files have been read, the fieldwork team will then examine and review any procedures or protocols that exist within the diocese to confirm that they are in compliance with the *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance* document issued by the NBSCCCI in February of 2009.

Step 14.

To complete the review, the fieldwork team will then seek to speak to those directly involved in the safeguarding structure in the diocese. This should include the Advisory Panel, a sample of parish safeguarding representatives, the designated person, the safeguarding committee,

Review of child safeguarding practice – The Daughters of the Cross of Liege

victim support and advisors and the Bishop/Provincial. The purpose of these interviews is to form a view of the competence and effectiveness of the safeguarding structure that exists within the Church Authority.

Step 15.

The fieldwork team will also seek to speak to representatives of the key statutory agencies to provide them with an opportunity to express their views on the quality of the working relationships that exist between them and the Church Authority.

Step 16.

A verbal feedback session on initial key findings will be given to the Church Authority.

Step 17.

Upon completion of the field work, the team may request to take materials – other than casework records to review off-site; this alongside all materials gathered by the reviewers, including written notes on cases and meetings, will be analysed and will form the basis of the draft assessment review report.

Step 18.

The draft will be forwarded to the Church Authority for factual accuracy checking.

Step 19.

Alongside all other reports under review, the report will be presented in draft to the Reference Group for their critique and comment. If further work is required at the direction of the Reference group the CEO will ensure this work is completed and advise the Church Authority accordingly.

Step 20.

The report will be legally proofed by NBSCCCI lawyer.

Step 21.

The report will be forwarded to the NBSCCCI for approval

Step 22

A final draft report will then be submitted to the Church Authority. The expectation would be that the report will be published by the Church Authority at an agreed time in the future.

Step 23.

All case material written, including summaries, as part of the review, which are for the reviewers use only, will be stored on a secure server.

Guide for Reviewers

In terms of small (female religious orders) reference should be made to the following:

1. Has the Order provided alternative care to children in an orphanage, industrial school or children's residential home, but no longer is engaged in running such services;
2. Has the order provided education to children, in both or either boarding schools and day schools, but no longer does so ;
3. Has the order provided medical and/or nursing services to children, but no longer does so;
4. Has the order provided any other services to children, in community services centres, youth clubs etc., and no longer does so;
5. Does the order currently provide any sort of service to children and families that brings them into regular contact with children;
6. Has the order never provided any service to children (e.g. contemplative orders).

In relation to category 1 above;

1. The reviewers will establish whether any service they provided is included in the list of children's residential services produced by the Residential Institutions Redress Board (RIRB);
2. If this is the case, reference should be made to this.
3. If complaints have been referred to the Redress Board or Ryan Commission, this review cannot access these records and that will be stated in the report.
4. If the order has received complaints which have not been processed through Redress or Ryan these cases will be thoroughly examined as detailed above.

Review of Policy and Procedures

1. It is recognised that not all Orders will have any ministry with children and therefore their policies and procedures should reflect the work that they do with children.
2. If the Order only works through other organisations, example in Diocesan work or in schools, they are required to follow the policies of those organisations.
3. If there are gaps in the policy document an assessment should be made as to whether the ministry engaged in requires full compliance with all criteria attached to the seven standards
4. Where it is clear that the criteria do not apply a reference should be made at the beginning of the review report that the Order's ministry is not directly with children and therefore adherence to particular criteria do not apply.
5. If the Order is a contemplative Order, there is no expectation that they will have detailed policies and procedures, but reference should be made to their ministry and that they have no contact with children.
6. In all cases, contact will be made with the civil authorities to identify if they have any child safeguarding concerns in relation to the order.