



THE NATIONAL BOARD FOR
SAFEGUARDING CHILDREN
IN THE CATHOLIC CHURCH

Private and Confidential

**Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Society of
The Daughters of the Heart of Mary
undertaken by**

**The National Board for Safeguarding Children in the
Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI)**

**This review was undertaken at the invitation of Sr. Mary Brogan
Regional Superior**

Date: July 2014

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
<i>Background</i>	3
<i>Introduction</i>	4
<i>Past and Present Role with Children</i>	5
<i>Profile of Members</i>	5
<i>Policy and Procedures Document</i>	6
<i>Structures</i>	6
<i>Management of Allegations and Liaison with Statutory Authorities</i>	6
<i>Conclusion</i>	7
<i>Terms of Reference</i>	7

Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Society of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary

Background

The National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church in Ireland (NBSCCCI) was asked by the Sponsoring Bodies, namely the Irish Episcopal Conference, the Conference of Religious of Ireland and the Irish Missionary Union, to undertake a comprehensive review of safeguarding practice within and across all the Church authorities on the island of Ireland.

The NBSCCCI is aware that some religious congregations have ministries that involve direct contact with children while others do not. In religious congregations that have direct involvement with children, reviews of child safeguarding have been undertaken by measuring their practice compliance against all seven Church standards. Where a religious congregation no longer has, or never had ministry involving children and has not received any allegation of sexual abuse, the NBSCCCI reviews are conducted using a shorter procedure. The size, age and activity profiles of religious congregations can vary significantly and the NBSCCCI accepts that it is rational that the form of review be tailored to the profile of each Church authority, where the ministry with children is limited or non-existent. The procedure for assessment of safeguarding practice with such congregations is set out in the contents page of this report. The NBSCCCI welcomes that in order to have full openness, transparency and accountability, religious congregations that do not have ministry with children have made requests to have their safeguarding practice examined and commented upon.

The purpose of this review remains the same and it is to confirm that current safeguarding practice complies with the standards set down within the guidance issued by the Sponsoring Bodies in February 2009 *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance Document for the Catholic Church in Ireland* and that all known allegations and concerns had been appropriately dealt with. To achieve this task, safeguarding practice in each of these Church Authorities is reviewed through an examination of policy and procedures and through interviews with key personnel involved both within and external to the religious congregation.

This report contains the findings of *the Review of Safeguarding Practice within the Society of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary* undertaken by the NBSCCCI in line with the request made to it by the Sponsoring Bodies.

The findings of the review have been shared with a reference group before being submitted to the Regional Superior of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary, along with any recommendations arising from the findings. The review is not based on a review of case material as during the relevant time period there were no allegations made against members of the congregation that were within the Terms of Reference. There also were no allegations in respect of other forms of abuse within the time period, in respect of deceased and living members of the Society. The review therefore is primarily based on policies and procedures made available plus interviews with key personnel involved in

the safeguarding process within the congregation, particularly in the services run by the congregation.

The fieldwork for this review took place on July 9th 2014 and the reviewer is very grateful to the sisters for their warm reception, their kindness and their openness.

1. Introduction

The Society Daughters of the Heart of Mary (DHM) was founded in France in 1791, at the time of the French Revolution, when the practice of religion was extremely dangerous. The co-founders of the new Society were Fr. Pierre-Joseph de Clorivière, ordained a priest in 1763 and who made his final vows as a Jesuit in 1773 and Adelaide de Cicé, a young Breton woman. Adelaide de Cicé was looking for a way to serve in religious life. She met Fr de Clorivière in 1774 and they both discussed the formation of a new type of religious Society. It is described on the DHM website that on July 19th, 1790.

In prayer and reflection, Fr. de Clorivière saw the plan of a religious Society; (one for men and one for women) and knowing it came from God, he wrote what he saw: 'A plan of a new religious Society adapted to alleviating the miseries of the times...The members of this Society, united in Jesus Christ by a purely interior bond, and having no external sign of their association and no specific costume...will live separately from one another as did the early Christians.' Very soon he called on Adelaide and presented his plan to her. She entered into the spirit of the enterprise, and as a Co-Founder, brought her own intuition and gentle feminine qualities to bear on this very original and unique way of religious life.¹

By 1790 Adelaide had gathered a group of like-minded women, but the establishment of a new religious order had to be undertaken in a somewhat clandestine manner due to the perilous political and civil climate in France at that time. She joined Fr. de Clorivière in Paris in April 1791 where they worked together in fostering the growth of the two new religious societies, the Society of the Heart of Jesus and the Daughters of the Heart of Mary.

The Motherhouse of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary (DHM) is in Paris and the Superior General is based there. Sisters of the Society live and work in 35 countries, which are grouped into Provinces/Regions. England and Ireland form a Region. The current Regional Superior is Sr. Mary Brogan. The Regional Superior is joined by three elected Councillors. The Regional Council is established for a three-year period of governance.

There are 18 DHM Provinces/Regions world-wide and approximately 1,200 sister members of the Society, 22 of whom are attached to the Region of England – Ireland.

¹ <http://www.dhmary.com> – Our History

Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Society of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary

The website of the DHM describes their varied missions to the world as including being a praying presence, holding professional responsibilities (as trained practitioners of social work, teaching, nursing and other health care professions etc.), doing volunteer work alongside the laity and collaborating in faith formation in parishes. The spirituality of the Society is Ignatian.

The organizational structure of the DHM in Ireland is very simple, with all members living between two houses in the same suburb of Dublin. They convene regular community meetings.

2. Past and present role with children

The Society of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary owned and ran a residential children's home in Dun Laoghaire, Co. Dublin, St. Joseph's Orphanage, from 1856 until its closure in 1984. They estimate that in that period of time they provided residential care to in excess of 2,000 children. The then Provincial of the Society gave evidence to the Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse concerning alleged abuse of children by two adult men, neither of who worked in the orphanage. The sisters also contributed to the Residential Institutions Redress Scheme and independent Trust Fund established to provide support to adult victims of historical institutional abuse. These events are a matter of public record and are not subject to examination in this review.

The sisters of the Society of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary are Trustees of St. Joseph's National School in Dun Laoghaire. A school was first opened in 1860. The school's present accommodation was opened in September 1962 and it is located adjacent to the Irish headquarters of the Society. St. Joseph's was originally a Montessori school, one of the first in Ireland. St. Joseph's National School has its own website at <http://www.dunlaoghaires.ie>.

The school has its own child protection policy (March 2012) as required by the Department of Education and Skills and this is given to all school staff. All members of staff are Garda vetted and the school complies with the safeguarding regulations of the Department of Education and the Archdiocese of Dublin.

There has never been a child safeguarding concern, complaint or allegation against a sister of the Society of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary.

3. Profile of Members

There are 8 members of the Society of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary in Ireland, seven of whom live in the Society's main convent and headquarters in Dun Laoghaire, Co. Dublin and the other of whom lives in a private house in a nearby parish.

The age range of the members of the Society in Ireland is from 62 to 92 years and all of the members are now retired from paid employment. They provide voluntary support and

assistance to parishes as choir members, readers and ministers of the Eucharist, with one sister facilitating prayer groups. Sisters who work in parishes follow the child safeguarding policy and procedures of the Archdiocese of Dublin. One sister is involved in counselling work.

4. Policy and Procedures Document

The DHM has a document on its website entitled *Child Safeguarding Policy – Daughters of the Heart of Mary*. This five-page document was accepted and signed by the Regional Superior in April 2009. It is to be read in conjunction with the NBSCCCI *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance Document for the Catholic Church in Ireland*. The DHM document is sufficient for the needs of the congregation and it contains contact details for the Designated Person, the statutory agencies, the NBSCCCI and for *Towards Healing*.

The DHM's Designated Liaison Person has had training through the Department of Education and Skills, the CSPS of the Archdiocese of Dublin and through the NBSCCCI in Maynooth. She is extremely conscientious and very knowledgeable about child safeguarding and she ensures that the sisters in the congregation are well briefed and alert in respect of their responsibilities to keep children safe.

Two other members of the Society undertook VDA training in 2009 under the auspices of CORI and the IMU.

5. Structures

Given the small numbers of sisters living in Ireland and the fact that there is no ministry with children through their Society, the safeguarding structure is limited to the Regional Superior and the Designated Liaison Person. The NBSCCCI is satisfied that this is adequate.

6. Management of Allegations and liaison with the statutory authorities

The DHM have not had to deal with any child safeguarding concerns or to manage any cases of suspected abuse, so they have not had to develop working relationships with the statutory child protection services. The DHM has made returns to the HSE National Audit of Safeguarding Arrangements in Religious Orders in Ireland. Contact was made with a senior manager in An Garda Síochána who stated that no concerns exist in relation to this religious order.

The views of TUSLA were sought and the following comment was received:

“This female Religious Order has been categorised as Category 2 meaning there have been no child sexual abuse allegations against members and those whose ministry does involve children in Ireland.

**Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Society of the
Daughters of the Heart of Mary**

Of the 10 members in Ireland as of 31.03.2013 a few members are involved in both school ministry and diocesan ministry where they are guided by the relevant child protection guidelines in place.

The Daughters of the Heart of Mary child protection policy has yet to be reviewed as part of our process. In the meantime we have no concerns about this Religious Order”.

7. Conclusion

The Society of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary has in place a child safeguarding policy and procedures and a Designated Person and it has ensured that it is keeping up to speed through the involvement of one of its members in ongoing child safeguarding training. There is no further child safeguarding initiative that this Society is required to take. Any activities that bring the members into contact with children, in the local school and parishes are governed by the child safeguarding policies and procedures that apply to those locations.

Review of Safeguarding in the Catholic Church in Ireland

Terms of Reference

Small Religious Congregations

(which should be read in conjunction with the accompanying Notes)

Introduction

In order for the National Board to be able to state that all Church Authorities on the island of Ireland have been evaluated in respect of their child safeguarding policies and practices, both historical and current, then some form of appropriate assessment has to be conducted of every one of these. It is rational however that the form of assessment is tailored to the profile of each Church Authority, and that needless expenditure of resources and unnecessary interference in the life of religious orders and communities that have no children-specific ministry would be avoided.

This Review seeks to examine the current arrangements for safeguarding children across small Religious Congregations /Orders, and Missionary Societies in Ireland who have limited or no direct contact with children as part of the Congregations ministry.

It would also scrutinize practice within all known cases to ensure that they have been responded to appropriately.

The review's methodology is an adaptation of the methodology developed for all Dioceses and large religious congregations and missionary societies, where the ministry involves regular contact with children.

The proposed Review would consider the following:-

- (a) Former role with children
- (b) Allegations of child abuse against members and how these have been responded to
- (c) Existing relationships with statutory authorities such as the HSE, Gardai in the Republic and the HSCT or PSNI in Northern Ireland.
- (d) Policies in place and being applied for safeguarding children
- (e) Roles and responsibilities and where they exist the operation of Advisory Panels, and Safeguarding Committees

The objective of the Review would be to confirm if there have been any allegations and how known allegations have been responded to; in addition the review seeks to confirm what the current arrangements for safeguarding children are. In particular, emphasis will be placed on establishing how policies and practice match up to the standards set down in the Safeguarding Children Guidance published by the National Board for Safeguarding

Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Society of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary

Children in the Catholic Church launched in February 2009. Priority, at all times, will be given to how policy and practice can be improved and strengthened. If policies and/or practices are identified that are concerning, inadequate, or dangerous, they will be addressed through the provision of guidance and support, and through the reporting of these situations to the appropriate statutory authorities, if this has not already happened. Similarly, those that are good examples will be highlighted with a view to them being adopted comprehensively across all parts of the Church. All cases that relate to alleged or known offenders that are alive will be read and included in the Review. In cases where the alleged or known offender is deceased, these will be sampled in an attempt to gather learning from them that will be used to inform the framing of recommendations.

Guidance Documents

The Review will be guided by the following:-

- (a) Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance;
- (b) Children First Guidance in ROI; and Regional Child Protection Guidelines in Northern Ireland;
- (c) Legislation that exists in each jurisdiction which contributes to safeguarding children and young people.

The Review will be undertaken by the National Board for Safeguarding Children through their National Office and led by the Chief Executive Officer.

The Review process will be overseen by a **Reference Group** to whom the CEO will report on a regular basis. The membership of this **Reference Group** has been drawn from each of the statutory child protection agencies in both jurisdictions, along with eminent individuals in the field from academia. The current Reference Group consists of : Dr Helen Buckley (TCD); Mr Paul Harrison (Tusla), and John Toner (SBNI).

It is important to confirm that the value of the Review is dependent upon full and complete access to all relevant documentation and information relating to the abuse of children known to the individual Church authorities. The Review will proceed on the basis that willingness exists on the part of each of the subjects of the Review to provide full access to the fieldwork team, subject, where relevant, to the terms of the Data Processing Deed agreed between the Sponsoring Bodies and entered into between the parties hereto.

Step Guide to the Review Process

Step 1.

A letter of invitation to review is sent by the Provincial/Regional Superior or other person responsible for the Congregation/ Order or Missionary Society (hereinafter referred to as 'the Ordinary').

Step 2.

The CEO will forward a survey to the provincial which will identify:

- Current number of members
- Past role with children
- Current role with children
- Total number of allegations received up to 2014
- Number of living members against whom there are allegations

Step 3.

For any Order where there have been allegations a full review will proceed, as per step 4 - 23. For those Orders where there have been no known allegations a desk top examination of policies and procedures will take place followed by a site visit to interview all relevant personnel within the safeguarding structure. For these orders **step 5 and 13-23** will apply.

Step 4.

The CEO and Ordinary will confirm the dates for the fieldwork for the Review, and names of the fieldwork team.

Step 5.

The Church Authority will be asked to make available all of the case files and related documentation in respect of any safeguarding concerns that have been identified within the diocese. The Church Authority will make available a room with wireless internet access for the reviewers to conduct their review of files, so that any records made by the reviewers can be directly typed and stored onto a secure server which is only accessed by the reviewers. In the absence of internet access the reviewers will type their notes onto a secure encrypted usb stick for later uploading onto the secure server.

Step 6.

The Church Authority will be requested to sign the revised Data Processing Deed prior to the arrival of the team.

Step 7.

The Church Authority will arrange a schedule of interviews with all who hold safeguarding roles within its functional area. The designated person and the Church Authority will be available to the reviewers throughout the period of fieldwork.

Step 8.

The fieldwork team when they arrive on site will firstly confirm that they have a suitable place to work in and that all the required documentation has been provided to them for their Review. In the event that the fieldwork team forms the opinion that the Church Authority has not provided access to all such documents, the Board shall give notice in writing to the Church Authority of the opinion of the fieldwork team and such notice shall specify the reasons for same. Thereupon, the Church Authority shall respond in detail to the Notice. Each party shall use its best endeavours to resolve any differences of opinion which shall arise and, in the event that resolution is not arrived at, the parties will attempt to resolve the dispute by recourse to the services of a mediator agreed between them or nominated for the purpose at the request of any of them without prejudice to the Board's entitlement to terminate the Review. In the event that resolution has not been arrived at following mediation, either party shall be at liberty to terminate forthwith the Review.

Step 9.

On arrival, the fieldwork team should be supplied with a single case file index that lists all the cases that have been created within the diocese. These may be divided into two groups. The first group will contain all allegations that relate to living alleged or known perpetrators. The second will contain any that are deceased.

Step 10.

Depending on the volume involved a decision should be made as to whether all or a random sample of the "deceased group" should be reviewed. Care should be taken to include all prominent cases in the sample.

Step 11.

Each case file will be reviewed by each fieldworker independently in the first instance. They will create a written summary with chronological information of the case. In certain cases a second reader may be required, this will be discussed and agreed between the fieldworkers.

Step 12.

Following the reading of the case and the creation of a summary, the fieldworkers will analyse and assess the actions taken in the case. They will assess compliance with agreed Church policy that was extant at that time. They will also indicate whether any current

Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Society of the Daughters of the Heart of Mary

risk exists in respect of the information contained within the file and advise the church Authority of necessary safeguarding action to reduce the risk.

Step 13.

When all the case files have been read, the fieldwork team will then examine and review any procedures or protocols that exist within the diocese to confirm that they are in compliance with the *Safeguarding Children: Standards and Guidance* document issued by the NBSCCCI in February of 2009.

Step 14.

To complete the Review, the fieldwork team will then seek to speak to those directly involved in the safeguarding structure in the diocese. This should include the Advisory Panel, a sample of parish safeguarding representatives, the designated person, the safeguarding committee, victim support and advisors and the Bishop/Provincial. The purpose of these interviews is to form a view of the competence and effectiveness of the safeguarding structure that exists within the Church Authority.

Step 15.

The fieldwork team will also seek to speak to representatives of the key statutory agencies to provide them with an opportunity to express their views on the quality of the working relationships that exist between them and the Church Authority.

Step 16.

A verbal feedback session on initial key findings will be given to the Church Authority.

Step 17.

Upon completion of the field work, the team may request to take materials – other than casework records to review off-site; this alongside all materials gathered by the reviewers, including written notes on cases and meetings, will be analysed and will form the basis of the draft assessment review report.

Step 18.

The draft will be forwarded to the Church Authority for factual accuracy checking.

Step 19.

Alongside all other reports under review, the report will be presented in draft to the Reference Group for their critique and comment. If further work is required at the direction of the Reference group the CEO will ensure this work is completed and advise the Church Authority accordingly.

Step 20.

The report will be legally proofed by NBSCCCI lawyer.

Step 21.

The report will be forwarded to the National Board for approval

Step 22

A final draft report will then be submitted to the Church Authority. The expectation would be that the Report will be published by the Church Authority at an agreed time in the future.

Step 23.

All case material written, including summaries, as part of the review, which are for the reviewers use only, will be stored on a secure server.

Guide for Reviewers

In terms of small (female religious orders) reference should be made to the following:

1. Has the Order provided alternative care to children in an orphanage, industrial school or children's residential home, but no longer is engaged in running such services;
2. Has the order provided education to children, in both or either boarding schools and day schools, but no longer does so ;
3. Has the order provided medical and/or nursing services to children, but no longer does so;
4. Has the order provided any other services to children, in community services centres, youth clubs etc., and no longer does so;
5. Does the order currently provide any sort of service to children and families that brings them into regular contact with children;
6. Has the order never provided any service to children (e.g. contemplative orders).

In relation to category 1 above;

1. The reviewers will establish whether any service they provided is included in the list of children's residential services produced by the Residential Institutions Redress Board (RIRB);
2. If this is the case, reference should be made to this.
3. If complaints have been referred to the Redress Board or Ryan Commission, this review cannot access these records and that will be stated in the report.

**Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Society of the
Daughters of the Heart of Mary**

4. If the order has received complaints which have not been processed through Redress or Ryan these cases will be thoroughly examined as detailed above.

Review of Policy and Procedures

1. It is recognised that not all Orders will have any ministry with children and therefore their policies and procedures should reflect the work that they do with children.
2. If the Order only works through other organisations, example in Diocesan work or in schools, they are required to follow the policies of those organisations.
3. If there are gaps in the policy document an assessment should be made as to whether the ministry engaged in requires full compliance with all criteria attached to the seven standards
4. Where it is clear that the criteria do not apply a reference should be made at the beginning of the review report that the Order's ministry is not directly with children and therefore adherence to particular criteria do not apply.
5. If the Order is a contemplative Order, there is no expectation that they will have detailed policies and procedures, but reference should be made to their ministry and that they have no contact with children.
6. In all cases, contact will be made with the civil authorities to identify if they have any child safeguarding concerns in relation to the order.